

SIMCOE COUNTY DISTRICT SCHOOL BOARD
ACCOMMODATION REVIEW COMMITTEE 2010:02

FINAL REPORT

REVIEW AREA:

**Barrie Central Collegiate Institute
Barrie North Collegiate Institute
Bear Creek Secondary School
Eastview Secondary School
Innisdale Secondary School**

March 2, 2011

ACCOMMODATION REVIEW COMMITTEE – 2010:02

**Barrie Central Collegiate Institute
Barrie North Collegiate Institute
Bear Creek Secondary School
Eastview Secondary School
Innisdale Secondary School**

CHAIR

Stephen Blake, Superintendent of Education

PARENT/GUARDIAN AND STUDENT REPRESENTATIVES

Barrie Central Collegiate Institute

Stuart Bailey, Parent/Guardian
Pam Burke, Parent/Guardian
Tyler Butler, Student

Barrie North Collegiate Institute

Jesse Bettencourt, Student
Lynne Patterson, Parent/Guardian
Karen Raymond, Parent/Guardian

Bear Creek Secondary School

Chesley French, Student
Karen Prowse, Parent/Guardian
Magda Tamas, Parent/Guardian

Eastview Secondary School

Catherine Baldwin, Parent/Guardian
Kirsty Hunter, Parent/Guardian
Frank Li, Student

Innisdale Secondary School

Cole Ferguson, Student
Heather Gleben, Parent/Guardian
Lisa Robertson, Parent/Guardian

MUNICIPAL REPRESENTATIVES

Mayor Linda Collins, Township of Springwater
*Councillor Mick Caldwell, Township of Springwater
Councillor Doug Lougheed, Town of Innisfil
*Councillor Peter Kmet, Town of Innisfil
Gail O'Brien, Township of Oro-Medonte
Councillor Lynn Strachan, City of Barrie
Councillor Deb Bronée, Township of Clearview

TRUSTEES

Donna Armstrong, Innisfil
Peter Beacock, Oro-Medonte and Springwater
*Diane Firman, City of Barrie, Wards 7, 8, 9, 10
*Julia Gasewicz, City of Barrie, Wards 4, 5, 6
Suzanne Ley, City of Barrie, Wards 1, 2, 3
Krista Mayne, City of Barrie, Wards 4, 5, 6
Robert North, Essa/Base Borden/Adjala-Tosorontio
Caroline Smith, Collingwood and Clearview
Christine Williams, City of Barrie, Wards 7, 8, 9, 10

SUPERINTENDENTS

Kathy Bailey, Superintendent of Education
Stephen Blake, Superintendent of Education
Phyllis Hili, Superintendent of Education
Anita Simpson, Superintendent of Education
Paul Sloan, Superintendent of Education

PRINCIPALS

Russell Atkinson, Barrie Central Collegiate
Michael Schneider, Barrie North Collegiate
David Boyd, Bear Creek Secondary School
Dana Barakauskas, Eastview Secondary School
Dawn Stephens, Innisdale Secondary School

LIAISON

Andrew Keuken, Senior Planning Officer

*Denotes past members.

BACKGROUND

On December 9, 2009, the Simcoe County District School Board approved an accommodation review of the secondary schools within the city of Barrie. The Accommodation Review Committee (ARC) was formed and given the task of conducting the review in accordance with the Board's policy 2313 to address the potential failure of key building systems at Barrie Central Collegiate Institute. Through consensus-building, decision-making and community consultation, the committee reviewed available options and developed appropriate, community-driven recommendations.

The committee members appreciated the opportunity provided by the Simcoe County District School Board to be engaged in the process that provides input into its decision. ARC members believe that in coming together with a commitment to address accommodation options related to the facility challenges at Barrie Central, recommendations to the Board have been created that are financially responsible and in the best interests of students. This final report, approved by voting members on March 1, 2011 outlines the recommendations of the Accommodation Review Committee and details the work completed by the ARC throughout the entire process.

PROCESS

The Accommodation Review was designed to be a transparent and consultative process. All meetings were advertised and conducted as per Board policy. Working sessions were open to members of the public. Minutes of working session meetings can be found in Appendix D. The four public meetings encouraged the involvement of an informed community. Minutes of these meetings can be found in Appendix E. Correspondence received by the ARC is presented in Appendix F.

In total, ARC 2010:02 conducted 12 working session meetings and 4 public meetings to share information, consult the public, and provide the basis for the content of this report.

Meeting dates and locations:

September 21, 2010	7:00 p.m.	Barrie Central C.I.	Working Session
October 5, 2010	7:00 p.m.	Barrie North C.I.	Working Session
October 19, 2010	7:00 p.m.	Bear Creek S.S.	Working Session
October 26, 2010	7:00 p.m.	Eastview S.S.	Public Meeting
November 2, 2010	7:00p.m.	Innisdale S.S.	Working Session
November 16, 2010	7:00 p.m.	Barrie Central C.I.	Working Session
November 30, 2010	7:00 p.m.	Barrie North C.I.	Public Meeting
January 4, 2011	7:00p.m.	Eastview S.S.	Working Session
January 11, 2011	7:00 p.m.	Bear Creek S.S.	Working Session
January 18, 2011	7:00 p.m.	Innisdale S.S.	Working Session
January 25, 2011	7:00 p.m.	Barrie Central C.I.	Public Meeting
February 1, 2011	7:00 p.m.	Barrie North C.I.	Working Session
February 8, 2011	7:00 p.m.	Bear Creek S.S.	Working Session
February 15, 2011	7:00 p.m.	Bear Creek S.S.	Working Session
February 22, 2011	7:00 p.m.	Innisdale S.S.	Public Meeting
March 1, 2011	7:00 p.m.	Eastview S.S.	Working Session

The process was divided into three phases: information gathering, analysis and formulating options leading to recommendations. At the beginning of the process, the committee was given the details of the SCDSB staff option (see Appendix A), provided with detailed reports related to the enrolment trends of 5 Barrie high schools and the condition of these schools. At each working session, members of the committee brought requests forward for additional information, including financial impact, and for Board staff to be present to answer questions to assist the ARC in preparing accommodation recommendations for the trustees of the SCDSB to consider.

The ARC was provided with objective information about each school to assist in the discussions for accommodation of students. Through the many working sessions, the committee also received a wide variety of reports on enrolment patterns, facility conditions, and School Information Profiles (see Appendix B), which included value to the school, value to the student and value to the community. Also included were information items from the City of Barrie such as intensification studies and partnership opportunities. These reports can be viewed on the ARC Website (see Appendix C).

Through the 4 public meetings held, the ARC listened to many delegations, questions, and comments from those who attended. Hard copies from some of the delegations that were made at these public sessions were provided to the committee.

The committee discussed several areas, not limited to but including, programming, enrolment and projections, facilities, transportation, financial considerations, partnerships, and attendance areas through the Terms of Reference.

The knowledge gained from all this information assisted the ARC to work through several possible alternative options and narrow down accommodation possibilities.

Following the final working session on March 1, 2011, the ARC's final report was submitted to Director of Education on March 2, 2011 meeting the established timeline.

TERMS OF REFERENCE

Factor	Comparison Criteria	Considerations
School Size and Grade Configuration	Grade 9 – 12 preferred 1200 – 1400 Students	Currently there are 7602 students enrolled in the five secondary schools in Barrie. Projected enrolment for 2015/2016 is 6520 students. One school is currently under capacity. The remaining four are over capacity. Distribution of existing students is weighted to the south. Board Staff agree that five schools are required for this current student population.
School Utilization	Enrolment vs. Capacity	There was a great deal of discussion surrounding enrolment and capacity of the existing secondary schools in Barrie. Concerns were raised regarding the closure of Barrie Central and the overcrowding of the remaining four secondary schools. This overcrowding would continue until a fifth school is built. There is already overcrowding in the south. Recognizing there will be growth in the south end of Barrie but uncertainty as to when the development will start in the annexed land and where the development will be (east or west of Hwy 400). Attendance area review may be needed to balance the enrolment.

	Community Use of Schools	School space is used by the community to support community groups and activities.
	Potential Alternative Uses of the Building Partnerships, leasing, disposition	City of Barrie passed Staff Report IDC003-11 on January 24, 2011 – Proposed Partnerships and Funding Options to Maintain the High School in the City's Urban Growth Centre. City Staff report supports a school in the downtown core of Barrie and proposed a number of potential partners for Barrie Central. There have been a variety of entities come forward to express an interest in partnering with Barrie Central. SCDSB staff pursue partnerships according to policy.
Financial Considerations	Projected Capital Costs	Capital funding from the 2010 Capital Plan will be very limited.
	Annual Operational Costs	Annual operational costs will remain constant in maintaining the five secondary schools. Repair, maintenance, efficiency costs differ.
	Capital Funding	Capital funding is required from the Ministry of Education to rebuild/refurbish Barrie Central and also required for a new growth school in the south end.
Transportation	Costs Efficiency	Transportation costs are an ongoing expense. It is important to maximize the walk zones and minimize the number of students on busses. Rural attendance area review would increase the distance and amount of time students are on busses. South end school would eliminate the need for bussing of some students.
Program Offering	Courses Required for Graduation	Current student population in the five secondary schools access all graduation pathways.
	Specialized Courses	All five secondary schools have specialized courses offered in a variety of areas. Enrolment supports a variety of courses in sports, art, music (instrumental and vocal), drama, dance, visual arts, communications, business, technology, computer.
	Specialist High Skills Major	All five secondary schools offer Specialist High Skills Major programs.
	Extracurricular Activities	All five secondary schools offer a wide variety of intramural and extracurricular activities. All five schools have sufficient number of staff to support these activities.

OPTIONS CONSIDERED BY THE ARC

Alternative accommodation options were generated and refined by members of ARC in a series of steps that evolved over a number of working sessions. Initially, members of the ARC were asked to “brainstorm” to identify the full range of options that could be tabled that addressed the objectives driving the ARC taking into consideration the information that was received as part of the Committee’s deliberations. This process identified the 14 Options listed in Table A.

Table A: List of Initial Alternate Accommodation Options Developed by ARC 2010:02

1) Boundary changes between the secondary schools. Moving students to Bear Creek and from Innisdale to Central in order to keep Barrie Central open.	8) Six school option. Maintain Barrie Central, refurbish and put in a business case for a secondary school in the south.
2) Relocate Grade 8 students coming into Grade 9 rather than moving current Barrie Central students (grandfather). Four year transition plan for school closure.	9) Negotiate with city on sale of parcel of land in the manufacturing area. Barrie Central site could be used by city for a police station.
3) Super school – take 2 schools that have a population of 1000 each and combine for a population of 2000 (Barrie North and Barrie Central). Build at the Allandale train station.	10) Attendance area review of Oro-Medonte students up to Line 9 (as part of the recommendation). Attendance area review for rural areas of Barrie North and Eastview. Include boundary changes for Springwater.
4) Rebuild of Barrie Central on same site or in the same vicinity and change the boundaries. Moratorium on a new school being built in the annexed land.	11) Expand 5 existing schools through additions.
5) Extend closure timeline to 2016, allow time for intensification, time for partnerships. Maintain Barrie Central until 2016.	12) Enhance/refurbish 4 Barrie schools, relocate Barrie Central students and let growth lead us into the next school construction.
6) A rename of the secondary school to Central North and the history, awards, etc. of both schools be integrated. Location would be the Barrie North site.	13) Disperse elementary students at Oakley Park and create a satellite campus to Barrie North.
7) Look at the programs and enhance the arts, magnet school for the arts on the existing site.	14) Addition to Barrie North using Oakley as a satellite school with a theatre addition to Oakley with a bridge connecting the two schools. Closing Barrie Central and distributing students to Barrie North.

These options were circulated to the ARC so that members could reflect on their implications and whether further information was required to better understand/refine each option. Once tabulated, the options and associated implications were discussed in break-out sessions involving voting and non-voting members of the ARC and observed by any members of the public that were in attendance.

The initial list of 14 options (plus the Staff Option) was refined to a list of 5 (including the staff option) based on a voting process whereby each voting member was allocated three votes to be cast on those options that they felt were the most viable. The voting was not meant to rank options based on popularity; rather it was meant to narrow the deliberations to those options the voting members felt had the greatest viability based on the information heard to date.

The four options that evolved from this voting process as well as the Staff Option are listed in Table B along with their key elements. These options along with the process used to generate them were presented at a public meeting held on January 25, 2011.

Table B: Refined List of Accommodation Options Presented at the January 25, 2011 Public Meeting

Option	Key Elements
Staff Option	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Close Barrie Central June 2012 • Re-distribute students to four remaining secondary schools • Consider attendance area review to balance attendance at Eastview, North and Bear Creek • Develop business case for new secondary school in south end opening 2015
Re-build on Alternate Site (Option 9)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Negotiate with City of Barrie on parcel of land in manufacturing area • Sell existing site to City of Barrie for alternate use
Amalgamate with Barrie North (Option 13/14)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Disperse students from Oakley Park Public School to create satellite secondary school campus • Move Central students to Barrie North using satellite campus for accommodation
Magnet School (Option 7)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Create school with unique/enhanced programming that would serve as a draw for students • Can be incorporated into any option that involves maintaining/rebuilding Barrie Central • Can leverage unique aspects of school (e.g., Fisher auditorium) for establishing partnerships
Status Quo (Option 5)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Maintain Barrie Central until 2016 • Allow time for identifying/securing partnerships for restoration/re-build • Allow time for intensification such that areas of growth are better understood

Subsequent to the Public Meeting of January 25, 2011, the four options plus the staff option were discussed in break-out sessions with the aim of arriving at a recommendation (or recommendations) each member could support. These are captured in the following Table.

Table C: Preliminary Recommendations Derived from Break-out Group Discussions

Group 1	<p>Talked about staff option, need for a school in the south end. Most of us in agreement that is where the students are. Looked at leaving Barrie Central open until 2016 with parameters. Looked at cost of maintaining until 2016.</p> <p>Could we temporarily accommodate the students at the four secondary schools? Parameters could include:</p> <p>By 2014 allow the City of Barrie to substantially develop a new official plan and zoning amendments to promote intensification that would attract growing families in accordance with the Places to Grow policy. If this doesn't occur, close the school in 2016 and allocate the students to the other four schools. Allow partnerships in accordance with board policy.</p>
Group 2	<p>Maintain Barrie Central with a timeline of 2016. Pursue partnerships. Set specific parameters. Allow time for partnerships to develop. Set benchmarks to create magnet schools that would attract specific partners.</p>
Group 3	<p>Leave Barrie Central open until 2016. Create a business plan for a school in the south end. Allow for partnerships. Should not close anything until there is a place for the students.</p>

PRELIMINARY RECOMMENDATIONS

At the working session held prior to the February 22, 2011 public meeting, where the ARC was required to present its recommendations, these preliminary recommendations were discussed and refined to form the basis of the final recommendations that appear in the next section of this report:

1. That Barrie Central remain open until September 2015;

AND
2. That the SCDSB actively pursue partners, with confirmed financial contribution in accordance with Facility Partnerships Policy 2345, specifically with the intention of addressing a rebuild of Barrie Central at the current location with a partnership agreement in place by December 31, 2014;

AND
3. That if the benchmark for partnerships has not been met by December 31, 2014, the Accommodation Review Staff Option will be implemented;

AND
4. That the SCDSB create a business plan for a secondary school in the south end of Barrie while actively pursuing partners in accordance with Facility Partnerships Policy 2345 to offset the costs of building a new Barrie secondary school.

FINAL RECOMMENDATIONS

At the final working session, further deliberations took place based on input from the February 22, 2011 public meeting. The final ARC recommendations are as follows:

1. That Barrie Central remain open while the SCDSB actively pursues partners, with confirmed financial contribution in accordance with Facility Partnerships Policy 2345, which includes consideration of private sector organizations, specifically with the intention of addressing a rebuild of Barrie Central at the current location with a partnership agreement in place by December 31, 2014;

AND

2. That if the benchmark for partnerships has not been met by December 31, 2014, the Accommodation Review Staff Option will be implemented with adjusted timelines set by the SCDSB;

AND

3. That the SCDSB create a business plan for a secondary school in the south end of Barrie while actively pursuing partners in accordance with Facility Partnerships Policy 2345 to offset the costs of building a new Barrie secondary school.